Evaluation of Soil Test Phosphorus Extractants and Tissue Analysis for Corn

G. A. Roa-Acosta  
*Kansas State University*, groa@k-state.edu

D. A. Ruiz Diaz  
*Kansas State University*, ruizdiaz@ksu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: [https://newprairiepress.org/kaesrr](https://newprairiepress.org/kaesrr)

Part of the *Agronomy and Crop Sciences Commons*

**Recommended Citation**

[https://doi.org/10.4148/2378-5977.8347](https://doi.org/10.4148/2378-5977.8347)

This report is brought to you for free and open access by New Prairie Press. It has been accepted for inclusion in Kansas Agricultural Experiment Station Research Reports by an authorized administrator of New Prairie Press. Copyright 2022 Kansas State University Agricultural Experiment Station and Cooperative Extension Service. Contents of this publication may be freely reproduced for educational purposes. All other rights reserved. Brand names appearing in this publication are for product identification purposes only. No endorsement is intended, nor is criticism implied of similar products not mentioned. K-State Research and Extension is an equal opportunity provider and employer.
Evaluation of Soil Test Phosphorus Extractants and Tissue Analysis for Corn

Abstract
The objective of this study was to evaluate the relationship of four different soil test phosphorus methods (Mehlich 3, Bray 1, Bray 2, and Haney H3A) for corn production, and determine critical P tissue concentration at different growing stages. The experiment was conducted at 12 locations, and the fertilizer treatments consisted of five phosphorus fertilizer rates applied by broadcast pre-plant. Soil samples were collected at 0- to 6-in. depth, then samples were collected before treatment application by block. Tissue samples were collected at the V6 and R1 growth stages. The relationship between the different soil test phosphorus methods and the $R^2$ varies between 0.24–0.93. Mehlich 3 and Bray 1 have a higher correlation, and Bray 1 and Bray 2 have a lower correlation. Linear plateau determined the critical phosphorus levels for the V6 growth stage was 0.42%, and for the R1 stage was 0.22%. The relationship between the concentration at V6 and R1 was moderately correlated with $R^2 = 0.62$, having a higher phosphorus concentration in the early stage.

Keywords
phosphorus, soil test, tissue analysis, corn

Creative Commons License
This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.
Evaluation of Soil Test Phosphorus Extractants and Tissue Analysis for Corn

G.A. Roa-Acosta and D.A. Ruiz Diaz

Summary
The objective of this study was to evaluate the relationship of four different soil test phosphorus methods (Mehlich 3, Bray 1, Bray 2, and Haney H3A) for corn production, and determine critical P tissue concentration at different growing stages. The experiment was conducted at 12 locations, and the fertilizer treatments consisted of five phosphorus fertilizer rates applied by broadcast pre-plant. Soil samples were collected at 0- to 6-in. depth, then samples were collected before treatment application by block. Tissue samples were collected at the V6 and R1 growth stages. The relationship between the different soil test phosphorus methods and the \( R^2 \) varies between 0.24–0.93. Mehlich 3 and Bray 1 have a higher correlation, and Bray 1 and Bray 2 have a lower correlation. Linear plateau determined the critical phosphorus levels for the V6 growth stage was 0.42%, and for the R1 stage was 0.22%. The relationship between the concentration at V6 and R1 was moderately correlated with \( R^2 = 0.62 \), having a higher phosphorus concentration in the early stage.

Introduction
Phosphorus (P) is a macronutrient that plays several essential roles in plants and is required in relatively large quantities. The available fraction of the total soil phosphorus is typically low, and phosphorus fertilizer is needed to meet crop phosphorus requirements. Understanding the adequate phosphorus rate in corn production is necessary to sustain high yield potentials. Phosphorus fertilizer may not be enough to replace what the crop is removing in the long term if rates are too low. Therefore, soil testing should be performed to determine the correct fertilizer rate for an economic yield response (Mallarino and Blackmer, 1992; Coelho et al., 2019). Critical concentrations of soil test phosphorus (STP) and critical tissue concentrations can be used to identify the response to phosphorus fertilization that should be expected. Critical levels could depend on many factors, including specific crops as well as soil characteristics, environmental, and other factors. Determining an appropriate concentration of STP and its relationship is a fundamental step required to make fertilizer recommendations. Error in determining the critical concentration results in an incorrect decision relating to fertilizer application (Mallarino and Blackmer, 1992). New STP methods for corn have not been evaluated recently in Kansas. The objective of this study was to evaluate the relationship of four different STP methods for corn production and determine critical P tissue concentration at different growing stages.
Procedures
Field experiments were conducted at 12 locations across Kansas (Table 1). The experimental design was a randomized complete block design with four replications; plots were 10-ft width × 40-ft length. Fertilizer treatments were four rates of P fertilizer (30, 60, 90, and 120 lb/a of \( \text{P}_2\text{O}_5 \)), using mono-ammonium phosphate (MAP) (11-52-0). Five treatments were established, including one control; all fertilizer was applied one time by broadcast pre-plant. Before treatment application, soil samples were collected, and composited by blocks at 0- to 6-in. depth using a hand probe. Corn was harvested, and yield was calculated and corrected to 15.5% moisture. Soil samples were dried at 104°F (40°C), plant tissue samples were dried at 140°F (60°C), and both were grounded to pass a 2-mm sieve. Soil samples were analyzed for pH, Mehlich 3, Bray 1, Bray 2 and Haney H3A, each with their respective methods extractions. Extractable P was measured at 660 nm using a colorimeter. The plant tissue samples were digested using nitric-perchloric acid digestion and analyzed using Inductively Coupled Plasma Optical Emission Spectroscopy (ICP-OES). Relationships between different STP levels were evaluated using linear regression models. Critical levels were performed between relative yield and plant tissue concentrations using linear plateau models. Data analyses were performed in R version 4.1.

Results
Correlations Between Different Soil Test Phosphorus Methods
Results showed that methods Mehlich 3 vs. Bray 1 and Mehlich 3 vs. Haney H3A were strongly correlated (\( R^2 = 0.93 \) and 0.80, respectively) and exhibit a linear relationship (Figure 1a, and Figure 1b). The Bray 1 and Haney H3A relationship was moderately correlated with \( R^2 = 0.60 \) (Figure 1c). All methods correlated with Bray 2 (Mehlich 3 vs. Bray 2, Bray 1 vs. Bray 2, and Haney H3A vs. Bray 2) were poorly correlated, with \( R^2 = 0.31, 0.24 \) and 0.47, respectively (Figure 1d, 1e, 1f).

Critical Phosphorus Concentrations
The critical tissue P levels for the whole plant at the V6 growth stage were 0.42 %, and the model \( R^2 \) value was 0.26 (figure 2a), as determined by a linear plateau. The critical P levels for the ear leaf at the R1 stage were 0.22%, and the model \( R^2 \) value was 0.18 (Figure 1b). Both \( R^2 \) values are low, with the ear leaf at R1 having lower value than the whole plant at V6. Stammer and Mallarino (2018) found a similar critical P concentration with a linear plateau for the whole plant at growth stage V6 of 0.48% and 0.25% for the ear leaf at the R1.

The relationship between the concentration in the whole plant at V6 and the ear leaf at R1 was moderately correlated with \( R^2 = 0.62 \) (Figure 3). The P tissue concentrations ranged from 0.25 to 0.64% for V6 and 0.15 to 0.42% for R1. The tissue P concentrations at the V6 stage were higher than at the R1 stage; this suggests that the value of tissue testing to assess plant phosphorus nutritional status may differ during the growing season.
References


Table 1. Study sites and soil properties for corn studies in 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>County</th>
<th>Soil series</th>
<th>pH</th>
<th>Mehlich 3 P</th>
<th>Bray 1 P</th>
<th>Bray 2 P</th>
<th>Haney H3A P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Republic</td>
<td>Crete</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Republic</td>
<td>Crete</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Franklin</td>
<td>Woodson</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Dickinson</td>
<td>Geary</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Shawnee</td>
<td>Bismarckgrove</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Gove</td>
<td>Keith</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Logan</td>
<td>Keith</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Gove</td>
<td>Keith</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Gove</td>
<td>Ulysses</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Saline</td>
<td>Longford</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Riley</td>
<td>Bourbonais</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Brown</td>
<td>Kennebec</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Samples were collected at 0- to 6-in. depth.
Figure 1. Relationship between different soil test phosphorus methods (a) Mehlich 3 vs. Bray 1, (b) Mehlich 3 vs. H3A, (c) Bray 1 vs. H3A, (d) Mehlich 3 vs. Bray 2, (e) Bray 1 vs. Bray 2, and (f) H3A vs. Bray 2. Soils with a pH > 7.0 are indicated by red dots.
Figure 2. Relationship between relative yield and the P concentration of (a) whole plants at the V6 growth stage or (b) ear leaf blades at the R1 stage. Vertical lines indicate a critical P level with a linear plateau.

Figure 3. Relationships between P concentrations at the ear leaf at the R1 stage and the whole plant at the V6 growth stage.